

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA
WESTERN DIVISION
No. 5:22-cv-00068-BO

YOLANDA IRVING, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE CITY OF RALEIGH, et al.,

Defendants.

**CITY OF RALEIGH'S RESPONSE IN
OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION
TO COMPEL**

Pursuant to F.R. Civ. P. 26 and 37, Defendant City of Raleigh, (the "City") respectfully asks the Court to deny Plaintiffs' motion to compel for the reasons set forth in the City's Memorandum and exhibits accompanying this response, and in the Official Capacity Defendants and the City of Raleigh's Responses and Objections to Plaintiffs' First Consolidated Set of Document Requests (ECF No. 148-2), all of which are incorporated herein by reference as if fully set forth herein.

The City also respectfully requests that the Court decline to award fees to any party, including the City, as such an award would be counter to efforts to collaborate on reasonable production of ESI.

Respectfully submitted, this the 16th day of January, 2023.

**CITY OF RALEIGH
Robin L. Tatum, City Attorney**

By: /s/ Dorothy V. Kibler
DOROTHY V. KIBLER
Deputy City Attorney
N.C. Bar No. 13751

By: /s/ Amy C. Petty
AMY C. PETTY
Senior Associate City Attorney
N.C. Bar No. 20894
PO Box 590
Raleigh, NC 27602
Tel: (919) 996-6560
Fax: (919) 996-7021
Dorothy.Kibler@raleighnc.gov
Amy.Petty@raleighnc.gov

*Counsel for Defendants City of
Raleigh, Chief of Police Estella
Patterson in her official capacity,
and City Manager Marchell Adams-
David in her official capacity*

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA
WESTERN DIVISION
No. 5:22-cv-00068-BO

YOLANDA IRVING, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE CITY OF RALEIGH, et al.,

Defendants.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 16, 2023, I electronically filed the foregoing **CITY OF RALEIGH'S RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO COMPEL** with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which sends notification of such filing to all counsel of record as follows:

Abraham Rubert-Schewel
Tin Fulton Walker & Owen, PLLC
119 E. Main Street
Durham, NC 27701
schewel@tinfulton.com
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Jason Benton
Daniel Peterson
Jessica Dixon
Parker Poe Adams & Bernstein, LLP
620 South Tyson Street, Suite 800
Charlotte, NC 28202
jasonbenton@parkerpoe.com
jessicadixon@parkerpoe.com
Counsel for Defendant Abdullah

Emily Gladden
Tin Fulton Walker & Owen, PLLC
204 N. Person Street
Raleigh, NC 27601
egladden@tinfulton.com
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Rodney Pettey
Yates McLamb & Weyher, LLP
PO Box 2889
Raleigh, NC 27602
rpettey@ymwlaw.com
Counsel for Defendants Monroe, Rattelade, and Gay

Michael Littlejohn, Jr.
Littlejohn Law, PLLC
PO Box 16661
Charlotte, NC 28297
mll@littlejohn-law.com
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Ian Mance
Elizabeth Simpson
Emancipate NC, Inc.
ian@emancipatenc.org
elizabeth@emancipatenc.org
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Norwood Blanchard, III
Crossley McIntosh Collier, & Edes, PLLC
5002 Randall Parkway
Wilmington, NC 28403
norwood@cmclawfirm.com
Counsel for Defendant Rolfe

Leslie Packer
Michelle Liguori
Ellis & Winters, LLP
PO Box 335500
Raleigh, NC 27636
Leslie.Packer@elliswinters.com
Michelle.Liguori@elliswinters.com
*Counsel for Defendants Garner, McDonald,
Twiddy, Mead, Ortiz, Perrin, Thompson,
Mollere, Webb, and Debonis*

CITY OF RALEIGH
Robin L. Tatum, City Attorney

By: /s/ Dorothy V. Kibler
DOROTHY V. KIBLER
Deputy City Attorney
N.C. Bar No. 13751
PO Box 590
Raleigh, NC 27602
Tel: (919) 996-6560
Fax: (919) 996-7021
Dorothy.Kibler@raleighnc.gov

*Counsel for Defendants City of
Raleigh, Chief of Police Estella
Patterson in her official capacity,
and City Manager Marchell Adams-
David in her official capacity*